# BEFORE THE COLORADO WATER CONSERVATION BOARD STATE OF COLORADO

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROPOSED ACQUISITION OF AN INTEREST IN THE SHOSHONE POWER PLANT WATER RIGHTS

JOINT REBUTTAL STATEMENT OF THE GARFIELD COUNTY BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS, CITY OF GLENWOOD SPRINGS, AND CITY OF RIFLE

Pursuant to the Hearing Officer's July 18, 2025, Order re Procedures and Deadlines for Prehearing Submissions and Rule 6m.(5)(f) of the Rules Concerning the Colorado Instream Flow and Natural Lake Level Program, 2 CCR 408-2 (the "ISF Rules"), the Garfield County Board of County Commissioners, City of Glenwood Springs, and City of Rifle (collectively, the "Garfield County Entities") hereby submit this joint rebuttal statement in support of the proposed dedication to the Colorado Water Conservation Board (the "Board") of the exclusive right to use the Shoshone Water Rights for instream flow purposes.

The ISF Rules instruct the Board to evaluate the appropriateness of the proposed dedication to preserve and/or improve the natural environment to a reasonable degree. Once the Board accepts the proposed dedication, the water court process will ensure non-injury to other water rights where ultimately, terms and conditions may be imposed by the final change of water right decree.

To that end, the determination at issue and in front of the Board is straightforward and *undisputed* by the parties – the proposed acquisition is appropriate to preserve and improve the natural environment and the best use of the proposed acquisition is to preserve and improve the natural environment.

Aurora Water, Colorado Springs Utilities, Denver Water, and Northern Water have indicated that they have concerns regarding the methodology used to quantify historic use of the Shoshone Water Rights. This determination sits squarely with the water court's jurisdiction pursuant to § 37-92-102(3), C.R.S., and is not appropriate for determination by the Board. The water court process is required as a standard procedure under the Water Right and Determination Act of 1969, § 37-92-101 C.R.S., and so long as proper notice is given, the water court shall have jurisdiction over all of the parties affected thereby, whether or not they choose to appear.

The Garfield County Entities note that the proposed dedication is the result of several decades of discussions and considerations between various stakeholders and partners statewide. The significance of this opportunity cannot be overstated.

Notably, the Garfield County Entities are uniquely impacted by the operation as the first parties physically situated at the bed of Glenwood Canyon. Maintenance of the historical flow regime created by the Shoshone Water Rights are necessary to meet the municipal, agricultural, environmental, and recreation needs of the middle Colorado River communities. If the Board rejects the proposed dedication, the historical flow regime created by the Shoshone Water Rights will be in jeopardy and downstream water users will suffer certain material injury.

Next, the City of Rifle and City of Glenwood Springs are two of the eighteen signatories to the Colorado River Cooperative Agreement (CRCA). The CRCA is clear when it states that the signatories agree to cooperate to achieve permanent management of the flows of the Colorado River, whether or not the Shoshone Power Plant remains in operation. In doing so, the CRCA requires the signatories to cooperate in preserving the historical call regime created by the Shoshone Water Rights on a permanent basis. To that end, the proposed dedication carries out the

intent of the CRCA. Regardless, it is not within the purview of the Board to interpret third party agreements to which the CWCB is not a party.

The Garfield County Entities fully support the proposed dedication and hereby incorporate the joint rebuttal statement of the River District et al. by reference.

We urge the Board to accept the proposed dedication and respect the jurisdiction of the water court,

Respectfully submitted this 29th day of August 2025.

GARFIELD COUNTY

BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS

CITY OF GLENWOOD SPRINGS and CITY OF RIFLE

Heather K. Beattie, #3

Janette Shute, #23221

Karl J. Hanlon, #27320

Danielle T. Skinner #54549

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on August 29, 2025. a copy of this JOINT REBUTTAL STATEMENT OF THE GARFIELD COUNTY BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS, CITY OF GLENWOOD SPRINGS, AND CITY OF RIFLE was served via email on each of the following:

Hearing Officer	Office of the Attorney Conord
Hearing Officer	Office of the Attorney General
Jackie Calicchio	John Watson
jackie.calicchio@coag.gov	john.watson@coag.gov
American Whitewater (AW)	Aurora Water (Aurora)
Hattie Johnson	Josh Mann
hattie@americanwhitewater.org	josh@mannwaterlaw.com
Basalt Water Conservancy District (BWCD)	City of Aspen (Aspen)
Christopher Geiger	Kate Johnson
chrisg@balcombgreen.com	kate.johnson@aspen.gov
3	3 3.
	Luisa Berne
	luisa.berne@aspen.gov
	Andrea L. Benson
	alb@alpersteincovell.com
	·
	Gilbert Y. Marchand
	gym@alpersteincovell.com
	Stephanie Pierce
	stephanie@alpersteincovell.com
City of Glenwood Springs (COGS)	City of Rifle (Rifle)
	, N. 11 1
Karp N. Hanlon kjh@mountainlawfirm.com	Karp N. Hanlon kjh@mountainlawfirm.com
Kyriemountainiawiimi.com	Kyfiernountainiawiirin.com
Danielle T. Skinner	Danielle T. Skinner
dts@mountainlawfirm.com	dts@mountainlawfirm.com
Ctove David	Detriel Weller
Steve Boyd steve.boyd@cogs.us	Patrick Waller pwaller@rifleco.org
, ,	, i
Clifton Water District (CWD)	Clinton Ditch & Reservoir Company (CD&RC)
Kirsten M. Kurath	Tom Daugherty
kirsten@mcdonoughlawgroup.com	tdaugherty@silverthorne.org
	Claus Barrali
	Glenn Porzak porzaklaw@gmail.com
	purzakiaw@gman.cum

Calamada Disam District (CDD)	C-1
Colorado River District (CRD)	Colorado River Outfitters Association (CROA)
Peter Fleming	David Costlow
pfleming@crwcd.org	dcostlow@croa.org
Jason Turner	
jturner@crwcd.org	
J. Carrier and the same of g	
Bruce Walters	
bwalters@crwcd.org	
Lorra Nichols	
Inichols@crwcd.org	
Colorado Springs Utility (CSU)	Colorado Water Conservation Board Staff (CWCB Staff)
Michael J. Gustafson	(CWCB Starr)
michael.gustafson@coloradosprings.gov	Jen Mele
Noth on Frederick o	jen.mele@coag.gov
Nathan Endersbee nathan.endersbee@coloradosprings.gov	Sarah Glover
nathan.endersbeedeoloradosprings.gov	sarah.glover@coag.gov
	Rob Viehl rob.viehl@state.co.us
Danuar Water (Danuar)	
Denver Water (Denver)	Eagle County Board of Commissioners (ECBC)
Jessica Brody	Sara M. Dunn
jessica.brody@denverwater.org	sarad@balcombgreen.com
Daniel Arnold	Beth Oliver
daniel.arnold@denverwater.org	beth.oliver@eaglecounty.us
James Wittler james.wittler@denverwater.org	
James. Wither each verwaren.org	
Crystal Easom	
crystal.easom@denverwater.org	
Eagle Park Reservoir Company (EPRCo)	Eagle River Coalition (Eagle River)
Beth Howard	Vicki Flynn
bhoward@vailresorts.com	flynn@eagleriverco.org
Fritz Halloman	
Fritz Holleman fholleman@bh-lawyers.com	
Kristin Moseley	
kmoseley@somachlaw.com	

Eagle River Water and Sanitation District & Upper Eagle Regional Water Authority	Garfield County Board of County Commissioners (Garfield)
(ERWSD et al)  Kristin H. Moseley	Heather K. Beattie hbeattie@garfieldcountyco.gov
kmoseley@somachlaw.com  Michael W. Daugherty	Christopher Geiger chrisg@balcombgreen.com
mdaugherty@somachlaw.com	Janette Shute jshute@garfieldcountyco.gov
Grand County, Colorado Board of County Commissioners (Grand)	Grand Valley Water Users Association (GVWUA)
Edward Moyer emoyer@co.grand.co.us	Tina Bergonzini tbergonzini@gvwua.com
Barbara Green barbara@sullivangreenseavy.com	
David Taussig davet@cjzwaterlaw.com	
<u>Homestake Partners (Homestake)</u>	Kobe Water Authority (KWA)
Michael J. Gustafson michael.gustafson@coloradosprings.gov	Ryan M. Jarvis ryan@jvamlaw.com
Ian Best ibest@auroragov.org	Charles N. Simon simon@jvamlaw.com
Philip E. Lopez plopez@fwlaw.com	Genevieve LaMee genevieve@jvamlaw.com
Mesa County (Mesa) Todd Starr	Middle Park Water Conservancy District (MPWCD)
todd.starr@mesacounty.us	Katie Randall katie@jvamlaw.com
Patrick Barker patrick.barker@mesacounty.us	Kent Whitmer kent@jvamlaw.com
	Genevieve LaMee genevieve@jvamlaw.com

Northern Colorado Water Conservancy District and Municipal Subdistrict, Northern Colorado Water Conservancy District (Northern et al)  Bennett W. Raley braley@troutlaw.com  Lisa M. Thompson Ithompson@troutlaw.com	Northwest Colorado Council of Governments (Northwest)  Torie Jarvis torie@sullivangreenseavy.com  Barbara Green barbara@sullivangreenseavy.com
William Davis Wert dwert@troutlaw.com	
Orchard Mesa Irrigation District (OMID)  Kirsten M. Kurath kirsten@mcdonoughlawgroup.com	Palisade Irrigation District and Mesa County irrigation District (PID/MCID)  Nathan A. Keever keever@dwmk.com
Pitkin County Board of County Commissioners (Pitkin)	Public Service Company of Colorado (PSCo)  Carolyn F. Burr
Richard Y. Neiley, III richard.neiley@pitkincounty.com	cburr@wsmtlaw.com
Anne Marie McPhee anne.mcphee@pitkincounty.com	James M. Noble jnoble@wsmtlaw.com  Matthew C. Nadel
Jennifer M. DiLalla jdilalla@mwhw.com	mnadel@wsmtlaw.com
Molly K. Haug-Rengers mhaug@mwhw.com	Frances A. Folin frances.a.folin@xcelenergy.com
Elizabeth "Libby" Truitt etruitt@mwhw.com	
Roaring Fork Conservancy (RFC)	Save The World's Rivers (SWR)
Heather Tattersall Lewin heather@roaringfork.org	Gary Wockner gary@savetheworldsrivers.org
Rick Lofaro rick@roaringfork.org	

South Metro WISE Authority (SM WISE)  Lisa Darling lisadarling@southmetrowater.org  Gabe Racz gracz@clarkhill.com	Southwestern Water Conservation District (SWCD)  Beth Van Vurst beth@vanvurst-law.com
Summit County (Summit)	Town of Basalt (Basalt)
Thomas W. Korver tkorver@hpkwaterlaw.com	Ryan M. Jarvis ryan@jvamlaw.com  Charles N. Simon simon@jvamlaw.com
	Genevieve LaMee genevieve@jvamlaw.com
Town of Eagle (Eagle)	Town of Vail (Vail)
Mary Elizabeth Geiger megeiger@garfieldhecht.com	Peter Wadden pwadden@vail.gov
Trout Unlimited (TU)	Ute Water Conservancy (UWC)
Drew Peternell drew.peternell@tu.org	Gregory Williams gwilliams@utewater.org Christopher Geiger
	chrisg@balcombgreen.com
Western Resource Advocates, Conservation Colorado, American Rivers, and the National Audubon Society (WRA et al)	
John Cyran john.cyran@westernresources.org	
Bart Miller bart.miller@westernresoures.org	

Angelique Petterson

## BEFORE THE COLORADO WATER CONSERVATION BOARD STATE OF COLORADO

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROPOSED ACQUISITION OF AN INTEREST IN THE SHOSHONE POWER PLANT WATER RIGHTS

EXPERT TESTIMONY OF MATTHEW R. LANGHORST, P.E., CFM – PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR, CITY OF GLENWOOD SPRINGS

The Garfield County Entities submit the attached written testimony of Matthew R. Langhorst, P.E., CFM – Public Works Director, City Of Glenwood Springs regarding environmental impacts to the Colorado River related to the Shoshone Water Rights.

Respectfully submitted this 29th day of August 2025.

GARFIELD COUNTY

BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS

Heather K. Beattie, #37417

Janette Shute, #23221

CITY OF GLENWOOD SPRINGS and CITY OF RIFLE

Karl J. Hanlon, #27320

Danielle T. Skinner, #54549

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on August 29, 2025. a copy of this EXPERT TESTIMONY OF MATTHEW R. LANGHORST, P.E., CFM – PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR, CITY OF GLENWOOD SPRINGS was served via email on each of the following:

Hearing Officer	Office of the Attorney Conord
Hearing Officer	Office of the Attorney General
Jackie Calicchio	John Watson
jackie.calicchio@coag.gov	john.watson@coag.gov
American Whitewater (AW)	Aurora Water (Aurora)
Hattie Johnson	Josh Mann
hattie@americanwhitewater.org	josh@mannwaterlaw.com
Basalt Water Conservancy District (BWCD)	City of Aspen (Aspen)
Christopher Geiger	Kate Johnson
chrisg@balcombgreen.com	kate.johnson@aspen.gov
3	3 3.
	Luisa Berne
	luisa.berne@aspen.gov
	Andrea L. Benson
	alb@alpersteincovell.com
	·
	Gilbert Y. Marchand
	gym@alpersteincovell.com
	Stephanie Pierce
	stephanie@alpersteincovell.com
City of Glenwood Springs (COGS)	City of Rifle (Rifle)
	, N. 11 1
Karp N. Hanlon kjh@mountainlawfirm.com	Karp N. Hanlon kjh@mountainlawfirm.com
Kyriemountainiawiimi.com	Kyfiernountainiawiirin.com
Danielle T. Skinner	Danielle T. Skinner
dts@mountainlawfirm.com	dts@mountainlawfirm.com
Ctove David	Detriel Weller
Steve Boyd steve.boyd@cogs.us	Patrick Waller pwaller@rifleco.org
, ,	, i
Clifton Water District (CWD)	Clinton Ditch & Reservoir Company (CD&RC)
Kirsten M. Kurath	Tom Daugherty
kirsten@mcdonoughlawgroup.com	tdaugherty@silverthorne.org
	Claus Barrali
	Glenn Porzak porzaklaw@gmail.com
	purzakiaw@gman.cum

0   1   0   0   0   0   0   0   0   0	0.1 1.5: 0.15: 4 1: (0504)
Colorado River District (CRD)	Colorado River Outfitters Association (CROA)
Peter Fleming	David Costlow
pfleming@crwcd.org	dcostlow@croa.org
Jason Turner	
jturner@crwcd.org	
B W II	
Bruce Walters bwalters@crwcd.org	
Lorra Nichols	
Inichols@crwcd.org	
Colorado Springs Utility (CSU)	Colorado Water Conservation Board Staff
	(CWCB Staff)
Michael J. Gustafson	lan Mala
michael.gustafson@coloradosprings.gov	Jen Mele jen.mele@coag.gov
Nathan Endersbee	
nathan.endersbee@coloradosprings.gov	Sarah Glover
	sarah.glover@coag.gov
	Rob Viehl
	rob.viehl@state.co.us
Denver Water (Denver)	Eagle County Board of Commissioners (ECBC)
Jessica Brody	Sara M. Dunn
jessica.brody@denverwater.org	sarad@balcombgreen.com
Daniel Arnold	Beth Oliver
daniel.arnold@denverwater.org	beth oliver@eaglecounty.us
	3 ,
James Wittler james.wittler@denverwater.org	
James. Wittier edenver water. org	
Crystal Easom	
crystal.easom@denverwater.org	5 1 5 2 2 111 (5 1 5 1 )
Eagle Park Reservoir Company (EPRCo)	Eagle River Coalition (Eagle River)
Beth Howard	Vicki Flynn
bhoward@vailresorts.com	flynn@eagleriverco.org
Fritz Holleman	
fholleman@bh-lawyers.com	
Kristin Massley	
Kristin Moseley kmoseley@somachlaw.com	
Milosofo y Csoffia offia w. Coffi	

Eagle River Water and Sanitation District & Upper Eagle Regional Water Authority (ERWSD et al)	Garfield County Board of County Commissioners (Garfield)
Kristin H. Moseley kmoseley@somachlaw.com	Heather K. Beattie hbeattie@garfieldcountyco.gov
Michael W. Daugherty mdaugherty@somachlaw.com	Christopher Geiger chrisg@balcombgreen.com
	Janette Shute jshute@garfieldcountyco.gov
Grand County, Colorado Board of County Commissioners (Grand)	Grand Valley Water Users Association (GVWUA)
Edward Moyer emoyer@co.grand.co.us	Tina Bergonzini tbergonzini@gvwua.com
Barbara Green barbara@sullivangreenseavy.com	
David Taussig davet@cjzwaterlaw.com	
<u>Homestake Partners (Homestake)</u>	Kobe Water Authority (KWA)
Michael J. Gustafson michael.gustafson@coloradosprings.gov	Ryan M. Jarvis ryan@jvamlaw.com
Ian Best ibest@auroragov.org	Charles N. Simon simon@jvamlaw.com
Philip E. Lopez plopez@fwlaw.com	Genevieve LaMee genevieve@jvamlaw.com
Mesa County (Mesa)	Middle Park Water Conservancy District (MPWCD)
Todd Starr todd.starr@mesacounty.us	Katie Randall katie@jvamlaw.com
Patrick Barker patrick.barker@mesacounty.us	Kent Whitmer kent@jvamlaw.com
	Genevieve LaMee genevieve@jvamlaw.com

Northern Colorado Water Conservancy District and Municipal Subdistrict, Northern Colorado Water Conservancy District (Northern et al.)	Northwest Colorado Council of Governments (Northwest)  Torie Jarvis
(Northern et al)  Bennett W. Raley	torie@sullivangreenseavy.com
braley@troutlaw.com	Barbara Green barbara@sullivangreenseavy.com
Lisa M. Thompson Ithompson@troutlaw.com	
William Davis Wert dwert@troutlaw.com	
Orchard Mesa Irrigation District (OMID)	Palisade Irrigation District and Mesa County irrigation District (PID/MCID)
Kirsten M. Kurath kirsten@mcdonoughlawgroup.com	Nathan A. Keever keever@dwmk.com
Pitkin County Board of County Commissioners (Pitkin)	Public Service Company of Colorado (PSCo)
Richard Y. Neiley, III richard.neiley@pitkincounty.com	Carolyn F. Burr cburr@wsmtlaw.com
Anne Marie McPhee anne.mcphee@pitkincounty.com	James M. Noble jnoble@wsmtlaw.com
Jennifer M. DiLalla	Matthew C. Nadel mnadel@wsmtlaw.com
jdilalla@mwhw.com  Molly K. Haug-Rengers mhaug@mwhw.com	Frances A. Folin frances.a.folin@xcelenergy.com
Elizabeth "Libby" Truitt etruitt@mwhw.com	
Roaring Fork Conservancy (RFC)	Save The World's Rivers (SWR)
Heather Tattersall Lewin heather@roaringfork.org	Gary Wockner gary@savetheworldsrivers.org
Rick Lofaro rick@roaringfork.org	

South Metro WISE Authority (SM WISE)	Southwestern Water Conservation District (SWCD)
Lisa Darling lisadarling@southmetrowater.org  Gabe Racz	Beth Van Vurst beth@vanvurst-law.com
gracz@clarkhill.com	
Summit County (Summit)	Town of Basalt (Basalt)
Thomas W. Korver tkorver@hpkwaterlaw.com	Ryan M. Jarvis ryan@jvamlaw.com
	Charles N. Simon simon@jvamlaw.com
	Genevieve LaMee genevieve@jvamlaw.com
Town of Eagle (Eagle)	Town of Vail (Vail)
Mary Elizabeth Geiger megeiger@garfieldhecht.com	Peter Wadden pwadden@vail.gov
Trout Unlimited (TU)	<u>Ute Water Conservancy (UWC)</u>
Drew Peternell drew.peternell@tu.org	Gregory Williams gwilliams@utewater.org Christopher Geiger chrisg@balcombgreen.com
Western Resource Advocates, Conservation Colorado, American Rivers, and the National Audubon Society (WRA et al)	
John Cyran john.cyran@westernresources.org	
Bart Miller bart.miller@westernresoures.org	
	Angelique Petterson

Matthew Langhorst DPW (970) 384-6438 (o)



101 West 8<sup>th</sup> Street Glenwood Springs, CO 81601

August 29, 2025

Jackie Calicchio, Hearing Officer Colorado Water Conservation Board 1313 Sherman Street, Room 718 Denver, CO 80203 jackie.calicchio@coag.gov

#### Dear Hearing Officer and Board:

Acquiring the Shoshone Water Rights for instream flow purposes will provide numerous benefits to water quality downstream of the proposed reach. By regulating the volume of water in the Colorado River, the Shoshone Water Rights regulate water temperatures and dilute sediment.

Water temperature is critical for not only supporting aquatic habitat but also for regulating temperatures at wastewater plant outlets, water plant inlets and stormwater infrastructure along the riverbanks. The cooler the water, the better it is for domestic use and for temperature regulation at outlets. Cooler temperatures slow down biological growth and help with taste and odor. Cooler temperatures also hold on to chlorine residuals longer in turn requiring a smaller initial dose to meet the chlorine life expectancy of the water through a system.

The stretch of the Colorado River below the Shoshone plant is known for having many "hot pot" locations and hot spring outlets. Cooler water on account of the Shoshone flows will help to regulate the temperatures in the river caused by these naturally occurring springs.

Further, the lower the water level in the river the faster it heats up in the summer months. The Crystal River and Roaring Fork Rivers are good examples where targeted releases of water in Ruedi Reservoir raise the level of the river to keep the temperatures down in the river. Preserving the Shoshone Water Rights would provide a baseline during times of low flows and high temperatures and preserve water in storage.

The increase in flow from the Shoshone Water Rights will help with sediment, mineral and electric charge dilution. Communities and districts that rely upon the river for drinking and irrigation water will benefit from this dilution factor. Highly sediment laden water is more difficult to treat with chemicals and the sediment removal rate needed to treat this type of water can overwhelm smaller plants that are not designed for the material. Higher sediment loads can require high dosing of the main coagulant to create sweep if the plant doesn't have enough settling time. While sweep flocculant is effective it is expensive and not an optimized use. Due to the recent fires in the area adding ash and other heavy metals to the water system, the

additional water volume will help dilute/reduce the negatively charged ash within the water, saving costs on chemical treatments that have to counter the negatively charged ash with positively charged chemicals.

Overall, the higher volume of water within the Colorado River system will provide conditions that are cleaner, less expensive, and simpler to treat for irrigation and domestic use along the basin.

Best Regards,

Matthew Langhorst, Public Works Director