



STATE OF
COLORADO

Ebert - DNR, Jared <jared.ebert@state.co.us>

Objection to Permit # M2017036, Knox Pit

Mandy Kotzman <Mandy@creativepursuits.net>
To: jared.ebert@state.co.us

Tue, Nov 7, 2017 at 12:20 PM

To: The Colorado Division of Reclamation, Mining, and Safety

Attention: Jared Ebert (jared.ebert@state.co.us)

1313 Sherman St, Room 215

Denver, CO 80203

From: Dr. Mandy Kotzman

(970) 581-4982

P.O. Box 1084 (mail)

3400 Orchard Drive (street)

LaPorte, CO 80535-1084

Mandy@CreativePursuits.net

7 November 2017

RE: Objection to Permit # M2017036, Knox Pit

I wish to lodge a formal objection to the proposal described in Permit #M2017036 known as the Knox Pit, filed by Loveland Ready-mix (Construction Materials Regular 112 Operation Reclamation Permit).

I live in LaPorte, about 1/3 mile from the western edge of the proposed gravel pit, and will be directly and adversely affected by the proposed mining operations. Since I will suffer actual loss economically, aesthetically, recreationally and in regards to conservation interests, I am an Aggrieved Party with regard to this application.

I request that the Mined Land Reclamation Board reject this application on the basis of unacceptable impacts and demonstrable losses to neighboring residents and the LaPorte community at large. The proximity of the to the 'town' of LaPorte makes its impacts unacceptable and 'unmitigatable'.

Economic losses:

I co-own a residential property ~0.3 mile from the west boundary of the proposed site of the Knox Pit. Research suggests that I could expect my property value to depreciate by at least 22% in perpetuity if this gravel pit is allowed to proceed. For many LaPorte residents, their home is their single most valuable asset.

From: An Assessment of the Economic Impact of the Proposed Stoneco Gravel Mine Operation on Richland Township - George A. Erickcek (2006) W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research. A report completed for the City of Kalamazoo, the City of Hastings, the City of Battle Creek, the City of Grand Rapids.

Furthermore, declining property values will decrease the property tax revenue collected by the County and State, resulting in less money for other County and State Programs from which I would benefit.

In addition, it is well documented that the heavier the vehicles, the greater the damage they cause to roads (e.g., Dr. W. James Wilde, 2014, Minnesota Department of Transportation Research Services & Library, **Assessing the Effects of Heavy Vehicles on Local Roadways**). The proposed gravel extraction project would add literally hundreds trips each day of heavy trucks (>23 tons) which are "noisy, dirty, polluting, unsafe, tear up the road and make it hard to cross the street" (Center for Spatial Economics, CAO Report 2009-001, **Property value losses from quarrying operations**) or to ride bikes on the road shoulders made uneven and slippery with drag out. Aside from danger and inconvenience caused by this traffic, the increased maintenance costs would also reduce the County's ability to support citizen services – a direct negative financial impact on me.

Aesthetically:

The eastern entrance to LaPorte has always had a low-key rural feel. The community's intention to preserve and enhance this valuable asset is explicitly enshrined in LaPorte Area Plan commissioned and accepted by Larimer County in 2004. I have had direct personal experience of how ugly gravel pits are to look at, how unpleasant they are to listen to, and how ugly the inevitable dust plumes are on windy days (to say nothing of the health impacts year round) – it has all happened here before, but fortunately further away.

Depression of ground water by as little as 3 ft can cause death to up to 90% of the adjacent trees (M.L. Scott, P.B. Shafroth and G.T. Auble, 1999, Environmental Management Vol. 23, No. 3, pp. 347–358 **Responses of Riparian Cottonwoods to Alluvial Water Table Declines**). The Knox pit would depress groundwater by at least 5' to 9' and would kill many of the old cottonwood trees near the site (as has happened adjacent to nearby gravel excavation sites), destroying wildlife habitat and being aesthetically unappealing. My past experience is that promises of amelioration of vegetation damaged by mining have been laughably inadequate and totally ineffective – a mockery and complete insult.

Recreationally and with regard to conservation:

I currently enjoy a lot of outdoor recreation in this area: riding my bike on roads and trails, walking, running and bird/mammal watching on nearby trails and in reserves along the Cache La Poudre River (<0.5 mi from the proposed mine site). Heavy, threatening truck traffic and its inevitable associated drag out on to the County Road would make bike riding on the road hazardous and undesirable. The noise and dust from the mining activity would diminish the desirability and quality of the recreational experience, and the loss of trees (from dewatering) would negatively impact bird and other animal life.

The LaPorte area has always been pretty quiet, with nighttime background noise levels below 40 decibels. Recent legitimate daytime rural activities producing 75 decibels (at the property boundary) were noticeable and irritating, but fortunately temporary. Recent research by the World Health Organization (WHO) deduced that healthy noise levels should not exceed 55 decibels during the day and 40 at night (<https://nhc.com.au/the-impact-of-city-sounds-on-your-health>). They state that exposure to high and medium-high levels of noise almost doubles the rates of irritability, mood swings, nervousness and worry in people, and almost doubled the rate of reported insomnia and sleep disorders, concentration problems and headaches. Excessive sound levels do create a real "noise sickness." These impacts not only constitute a health risk, but also potential loss of economic productivity.

It is too late to seriously consider mining this site now that it sits adjacent to the 'town' of LaPorte. Its combined impacts on me, and other, nearby residents are unacceptable and unreasonable. Please deny Loveland Ready-Mix Permit #M2017036 known as the Knox Pit.

Sincerely,

Mandy



PastedGraphic-1.pdf

36K